



## **LEFT OUT**

HOW EXCLUSION IN CALIFORNIA'S COLLEGES  
AND UNIVERSITIES HURTS OUR VALUES, OUR  
STUDENTS, AND OUR ECONOMY



### WHAT COLLEGE, BUSINESS, STUDENT, COMMUNITY AND NATIONAL LEADERS ARE SAYING ABOUT *LEFT OUT* MARCH 2018

#### COLLEGE AND UNIVERSITY LEADERS

---

“The racial disparity between students and faculty in our 3 systems of public higher education is a function of a system that defines merit, excellence, and experience in racially biased ways.

We cannot hold on to a system of hiring that is blind to California’s racial diversity and dire need for more college educated Latinx. To do so is to commit academic mal practice.

I hope this report will not elicit the typical excuses that blame lack of diversity to a shortage of advanced degrees among People of color and go on with business as usual. This is a problem that can be solved. We need to recognize that we cannot wish for more diversity by holding on to a system that is biased toward White candidates.”

**Estela Mara Bensimon**  
Dean’s Professor in Educational Equity & Director Center for Urban Education  
Rossier School of Education, University of Southern California

“Kudos to this thoughtful and comprehensive analysis that calls attention to the tremendous need to identify and nurture educational leaders who reflect the diverse populations that enroll in all three sectors of higher education institutions in California. For example, while Asian Pacific Americans are the most visible minority student group in California’s higher education, there is a striking absence of their participation in decision-making bodies, such as governing boards and executive campus leadership. This report underscores the tremendous challenge that California’s postsecondary education community faces as it strives to improve access and success for all students. Including more diverse role models who can understand and validate students’ unique experiences is an essential component to student success. California’s higher education community needs to look for solutions internally as well as in partnership with organizations like the Asian Pacific Americans in Higher Education (APAHE), that strive to educate, advocate, and advance diverse leaders.”

**Samuel H. Bersola, Ph.D.**  
Assistant Vice Provost for Graduate Education  
University of California, Los Angeles

"For colleges and universities committed to closing student achievement gaps, a racially and gender diverse faculty, staff, and administration is a critical component. We in academia often say that we want a diverse faculty and staff, but our practices seem to indicate otherwise. If we really want to attract and retain a more racially and gender diverse faculty, staff, and administration, college leaders at all levels need the courage to make some changes in how searches and selection processes are conducted, and we need to be more engaged in mentoring promising and diverse future colleagues."

**George R. Boggs, Ph.D.**  
**Superintendent/ President Emeritus, Palomar College**  
**President and CEO Emeritus, American Association of Community Colleges**

"I think it's important for the leadership of an institution to reflect its student body. Students need to feel like their experiences, their backgrounds and their perspectives are represented in the institution's leadership because institutional leaders are responsible for making decisions that are not only in the best interest of the institution but also in the best interest of the students. So, it's important for students to know that decisions are being made by people who understand their real life experiences, have some understanding of what their lives are like, what are the challenges they experience and the assets that they bring to the institution."

**Dr. Frank Harris III**  
**Professor of Postsecondary Educational Leadership and Student Affairs**  
**San Diego State University**

"When we have Latinx and African Americans in our faculty and administrators we are more able to transform the classroom. And the way we teach begins to change and better addresses the needs of our students. If done right, it can result in lessening bias and discrimination on behalf of those who are members of the dominant group."

**Arturo O'Campo**  
**District Director, Diversity and Compliance**  
**North Orange County Community College District**

"In order for campuses to better serve students, having quality leaders who reflect their community is a big part of diversity and inclusion. Equitable representation also includes having women serve at every level of campus because many community college students are first-generation and are not familiar with the inner workings of higher education. When students see counselors, staff, managers, faculty, and board members who look like them and share their experiences, it opens the door for more engagement and more opportunities for growth,"

**Marisa Perez**  
**Member, Cerritos College Board of Trustees**

“California has strongly established itself as a national leader and innovator on inclusive policies that extend rights and opportunities to all residents. This report shows us that much remains to be done in the state’s public higher education system, long considered one of the strongest in the world. It is essential for us to do our part to ensure that the promises and benefits of diversity are evident not only at the bottom, but throughout. The future of the California dream depends on it.”

**Karthick Ramakrishnan**  
**Associate Dean and Director, Center for Social Innovation**  
**University of California, Riverside**

“As educational leaders, it is our collective responsibility to purposefully serve our higher education community and, at the same time, to challenge it. This report points to the sobering truth of the racial and gender disparities that persist at our public institutions. We should view this report both as a leadership imperative and as a strong call to action and accountability for leadership that is more reflective of the communities we are charged to serve.”

**Dr. Francisco Rodriguez**  
**Chancellor**  
**Los Angeles Community College District**

“In 1960 California led the nation with a Master Plan aimed at increasing equity and economic competitiveness. In 2018 the state needs to lead the way again by enacting the measures suggested in this report.”

**William G. Tierney**  
**Wilbur Kieffer Professor of Higher Education**  
**University Professor & Co-director,**  
**Pullias Center for Higher Education**  
**University of Southern California**

"This is critically important work that the Campaign for College Opportunity has taken on. As a former student myself, seeing teachers that reflected my background and experience provided me with great motivation. As a person of color, that representation mattered to me and shaped my own pathway into leadership. It's my hope that all California college and university leaders take this issue up as they try to do more to engage students of color and ultimately help our students succeed."

**Joseph Williams**  
**President, San Bernardino Community College District Board of Trustees**

“California has prided itself for being on the leading edge of important social movements, the pursuit of equity being important among them. *Left Out* reveals that with regard to leadership in public higher education in our state we have a considerable way to go, but there are straight-forward ways to get there.”

David Wolf

Executive Director Emeritus, Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges, Western Association of Schools and Colleges

"Left Out provides detailed insight into the incredible representational inequities within our college and university system. The report highlights that California has a long way to go to increase the racial/ethnic representation within the faculty and administrative ranks. In a state so rich with diversity, Left Out demonstrates that "segregation" and "isolation" are endemic in our systems. The persistence of Ivory Tower staffing in an era demarcated by equity and diversity is both outdated and a threat to the future vitality of the state. Fortunately, the report provides tangible recommendations on how to turn these towers into bastions of racial inclusion."

J. Luke Wood, PhD

Dean's Distinguished Professor of Education, College of Education  
Director, Joint Ph.D. Program in Education with Claremont Graduate University  
Director, Ed.D. Program in Community College Leadership  
Co-Director, Community College Equity Assessment Lab (CCEAL)  
San Diego State University

## BUSINESS LEADERS

---

“Diversity is California’s greatest strength. At its roots the Campaign for College Opportunity’s *Left Out* must be a catalyst for discussion that leads to systemic change.

A diverse student body needs a faculty and leadership that reflect who students are and who appreciate how students experience the joys and challenges of the college going experience.

The findings of this report are not about demographics, they are about helping our education leaders and state policy makers understand that this issue of a lack of diversity is tied to student success.”

Paul Granillo

President and CEO, Inland Empire Economic Partnership

“As our state economy continues to dramatically innovate, this Campaign for College Opportunity report is a critically important assessment of how our UC and CSU systems can meet the need to deliver a more highly educated workforce.”

**Rob Lapsley**  
President, California Business Roundtable

## STUDENT LEADERS

---

“Having a teacher, professor or mentor that resembled me was essential to feeling that I belonged and helping me envision my future. Had I not had women of color in these roles, I may have not been bold enough to see myself pursuing an advanced degree.”

**Teresa Jean Ambo**  
UC President’s Scholar, UC San Diego

“During my undergraduate career, in both a community college and UC Riverside, I never had a black professor in Psychology. I had two Asian professors at UCR, but that was the most diversity I saw within the department. As an undergrad at UCR I felt as though they took for granted the fact that they have so many undergrads that are from diverse backgrounds, therefore they don't feel the need to have diversity hires. Or at least I wasn't aware of any efforts made by UCR to diversify its faculty when I was a student.”

**Tatiana Garcia-Meza**  
2015 UC Riverside Graduate

“It’s not just about diversifying the faces on campus but, diversifying the experiences in the classroom and honoring the fact that, especially in the political era that we’re in today, there are students that have a reality, a historical context that maybe doesn’t align with the standard political or historical context of the college environment.”

**Olivia Light**  
Senior, UCLA

## CALIFORNIA AND NATIONAL LEADERS

---

"California’s diverse student populations deserve institutions that are effective in meeting their needs, tapping their strengths and serving their academic aspirations through to completion, workforce success and civic engagement. *Left Out* makes clear the opportunities for California’s higher education institutions to fulfill their public missions to educate, graduate today’s students to meet the state’s and country’s workforce and economic needs.

**Sarita A. Brown**  
President, *Excelencia* in Education

“Increasing college access and success is possible, but it must be intentional and guided by a true commitment to equity for students, faculty and campus leaders. *Left Out* spotlights the race and gender disparities between increasingly diverse student populations, and faculty and campus leaders at California’s public colleges. The analysis includes smart recommendations urging state and campus leaders to ensure public institutions reflect the diverse perspectives and experiences of all students.”

**Michelle Asha Cooper, Ph.D.**  
**President, Institute for Higher Education Policy**

“Left Out is a critical and timely wake-up call for leadership at California's public colleges and California’s future Latinx, Black, and AANHPI leaders looking to address racial and gender inclusive leadership in our state's higher education system. Over two-thirds of the students enrolled at the UC, CSU and CCC are students of color. It's time that diversity is represented in California's higher education leadership.”

**Rachel Fleischer**  
**National Executive Director, Young Invincibles**

“The benefits of diversity in education have been well documented for students of color and for White students alike. Students’ experience in diverse classrooms—from preschool through college—exposes them to different backgrounds and cultures, prepares them for engaged citizenship, and helps them to succeed in an increasingly global economy. It’s critical for all students to see leaders of color in academia, in business, and in their communities. Indeed, from the classroom to the boardroom, diversity can enhance creativity, reduce bias, and offer exposure to new perspectives. And representation matters— young people cannot be what they cannot see. *Left Out* offers California’s public higher education system a wake-up call on the imperative to ensure equitable representation of people of color at the highest levels within the state’s public colleges and universities.”

**John B. King Jr.**  
**President and CEO, The Education Trust**  
**Former U.S. Secretary of Education**

"California has an unparalleled opportunity to showcase how diversity can advance equity and expand opportunity. But with respect to leadership at our public colleges and universities, *Left Out* demonstrates that we are simply not getting the job done. Having a mostly non-White student body with a majority White faculty and campus leaders is both detrimental to student learning and unsustainable for a system of higher education that depends on public support. It is my hope that *Left Out* will be the wake-up call that many State leaders need to fully practice rather than solely preach the rhetoric of inclusion and diversity."

**Vincent Pan**  
**Co-Executive Director, Chinese for Affirmative Action**

“It’s encouraging to see that Latino students are enrolling in higher education at record numbers. Despite the gains we remain concerned about college completion and the overall experience of Latino students in institutions of higher learning. A key factor in this is the diversity of a school’s leadership across the spectrum from faculty to senior institutional leadership. This report provides a snapshot of the California system and it sheds a spotlight on what more can be done to ensure that colleges and universities can better reflect the diversity of the students they serve and advance the values of inclusivity we believe is important to success in college for historically underrepresented students.”

**Eric Rodriguez**  
Vice President, UnidosUS

“*Left Out* rightly calls on California to recognize the need to remove dangerous systemic barriers in order to recruit and retain more people of color and women into higher education faculty and leadership positions. Continuing to turn a blind eye to hiring practices that reinforce institutional racism and sexism holds our students, our state, and our economy back. This report is a must-read – and a must-act – for anyone invested in the future of California.”

**Ryan J. Smith**  
Executive Director, The Education Trust-West

“College campuses are places where ideas are born, opinions shared, and values formed among students and faculty. Students not only need campus leaders who understand and relate to them but who also can also help them contextualize their own views while exploring those of people who see the world differently. The Campaign for College Opportunity’s report, *Left Out*, makes important recommendations aimed at improving racial and gender diversity among faculty and senior leadership, including improving practices around hiring, professional development, training, data collection, among others. By taking these recommended steps, campuses can become more inclusive and help more learners graduate and go on to successful careers.”

**Peter J. Taylor**  
President, ECMC Foundation